Cognitive Grammar Beyond the Sentence

English and Czech discourse connectives in conceptual contrast

Dominik Lukeš
, Brighton 2005
www.bohemica.com/text

Outline

- Caveats
- Cognitive Grammar and Text
- Examples of problems
  - Where vs. Kde – connectives as constructions
  - Totiž vs. Because – cohesive harmony as construction
- Conclusions / Further Questions

Cognitive Grammar and Text

Metaphors for text: Text is a sentence; Text is an ouevre of work (Hoey, 1991)

Metaphor for text in CG: "the clause is a fundamental unit in language" (Taylor, 2002) "clause packages" (Nir-Sagiv, this conference)

"Cognitive grammar presupposes an inherent and intimate relation between linguistic structures and discourse." … "Bringing them together does not require any modifications in the framework, but is simply a matter of exploiting the potential which has been there all

Adding an account of these concepts to CG may be equivalent to Croft's attempt to add social dimension.

(Fauconnier, 1994), rrent Discourse 1990); "Discourse Relations" (Knott et al., 200

Concepts not explicit in CG: texture (Halliday and Hasan, 1976); cohesive harmony (Hasan, 1984); patterns of lexis (Hoey, 1991), semantic prosody (Louw, 1993); textual function of linguistic units (Halliday, 1994)

“I think war is a dangerous place.”

G. W. Bush (from the top of a poster on Bushisms)

ACS 1313 But it also strained credulity to believe that any sort of **war where** any sort of nuclear weapons were available would not eventually lead to full-scale atomic destruction.

where (commonly refers to metonymic or metaphorical locations)

HA9 2122 Shannon named the **television station where** she'd worked before turning freelance, and the other woman pursed her lips thoughtfully.

HJG 206 I don't know of any other **event where** you get that kind of pressure and you just can't simulate that.

where (BNC about 20% in a random sample of 50 non-locational)

A9D **726** **Electrical retailing** provides one **example where** the one-person shop with its promise of good advice and after-sales service can score over the anonymity of a Dixons or a Comet.

FUA **1334 Where** it is **feasible to let students** take it over, the camera is simply a tool used to carry out a task which students find engrossing, exciting and therefore highly motivating.

Kde (where)

in prescriptive grammar reference to locations only – exemplified in the work of editors

Corpus (CNC) evidence more complicated as institutions and categories conceptualized as locations are common and about 5% of examples non-locational

CNC **rentgenový snímek Freudovy lebky** [X-Ray of Freud's skull] z profilu , **kde** bylo vidět , jak mu sedumnáct let rakovina automatickým textem požírala lícní kosti

CNC Řeší se tím zároveň problém předčasné ejakulace . Tato metoda je vhodná **tam** , **kde** je **potřeba dosáhnout spolehlivé erekce v určitém časovém intervalu a po určitou dobu**.

Non-locational uses primarily in specialist or translated areas where influence of English is likely

***where* construction**

profile whole discourse space
or profile location in or directionality into discourse space

place figure in discourse space
(context decides blend)

***kde* construction**

profile location in discourse space

place figure in locations within discourse

When? vs. Kdy? (when-adv) / Když? (when-rel)

ABU 1611 It showed ***what could be achieved*** **when** the **Treasury and the DHSS worked together**.

AJC 17 We have learned not to repeat the **South Atlantic Fund** (**when** too much compensation money was handed out quickly).

Causal connective constructions

totiž vs. *for/because*

(1) Jenom já často neklečel, ale (2) sedl jsem si jen na bobek, ačkoli tento způsob byl zakázán. (3) Také nohy mnohem víc bolely a (4) těžko se vstávalo. (5) Míval jsem **totiž** často rozbité podrážky a (6) styděl jsem se za to.

(1) I was the only one who often didn't kneel but (2) I squatted down instead even though this way was forbidden. (3) Also my legs hurt much more and (4) it was hard to get up. (5) [It was **because**] the soles of my shoes often wore out (6) and I felt ashamed for it. (Hrbáček, 1994)

totiž connects 5 and 6 and 5 and 1 and 2. Indirect connection to 3 and 4.

Parallel Corpus Evidence

totiž **zero = 15 – 2 E-C**
***for* = 7 – 3 E-C, Lit**
***because* = 1 – EC**
Total = 26 (only 6 English-to-Czech)

Když **totiž** policie, povolaná telefonicky, se dostavila na místo činu, nalezla lupiče v hlubokém bezvědomí s velkou tržnou ranou na hlavě.

Someone had telephoned for the police. **[zero]** When they arrived on the scene they found the burglar unconscious and with a deep gash in his head.

kriminalisté nevylučovali možnost, že motivem útoku nebyla rasová nenávist, ale vyřizování osobních účtů. Členkou party skinheadů **totiž** byla dříve dívka, která byla v době útoku přítelkyní syna Milana Kováče a bydlela s ním právě v onom bytě s jeho rodinou.

criminologists didn't rule out the possibility that motive of the attack wasn't racial intolerance, but the settling of personal accounts. **[zero]** A former member of this group of skinheads was a girl who was at the time of the attack the girlfriend of Milan Kovac's son and she was living with him in that house with his family.

Doktor Vlach si **totiž** rozdělil lidi podle toho, jak se chovají v poloprázdné kavárně, mají-li před sebou mísu koblih. Představte si luxusní kavárnu za nedělního dopoledne. Venku je krásný den a hostů v kavárně je málo. Už jste se nasnídali, přečetli jste všechny noviny a teď jste se pohodlně opřeli v měkkém boxu a zamyšleně se díváte na mísu koblih. Nuda se pomalu rozlézá do všech koutů kavárny.

You have to appreciate that Doctor Vlach classifies people according to their behaviour in a half-deserted café when faced with a bowl of doughnuts. Imagine a high-class café on a Sunday morning. It's a glorious sunny day and there are very few customers inside. You've taken breakfast, read all the newspapers and now you are lounging comfortably in a well-upholstered alcove, gazing thoughtfully at a bowl full of doughnuts. Tedium gradually filters into every corner of the café.

Nechápu, jak dospělý a rozumný člověk může myslit na takové věci. Přitom však úplně souhlasím s tím, že doktor Vlach, jak sám říká, patří do této skupiny. Z jakýchsi nepochopitelných důvodů je na to hrdý. Považuje tento druh lidí za duševně vyspělejší. Já si ovšem nedovedu představit, co má společného s duševní vyspělostí představa koblih, rozbíjejících se o hlavy pokojných návštěvníků kavárny. Nedovedu si to představit, ale, prosím, nebudeme se o to přít. Mám **totiž** ustálené mínění o debatách s doktorem Vlachem. Kdykoliv jsem se **totiž** do takové debaty pustil, připadal jsem si jako člověk, který z pošetilosti prorazil zeď údolní přehrady.

I fail to understand how an intelligent adult can think of such things. Yet I concur entirely with Doctor Vlach's view of himself as one who does belong to the latter category. And for some unfathomable reason is proud of the fact! He views such people as intellectually more mature. For my own part, I am mystified as to what unites intellectual maturity and the image of doughnuts splattering on the heads of innocent coffee-drinkers. It's beyond me, but so be it; let's not argue about it. I have [**zero]** an unshakeable view of debates with Doctor Vlach, **for** whenever I have entered upon one I have inevitably had the feeling of one who has been crazy enough to batter a hole in the retaining wall of a high dam using only his head.

Henry was important, but important rather as an elephant is important, from the size of his department; **[zero]** there are some kinds of importance that remain hopelessly damned to unseriousness.

Henry byl důležitý, ale spíš rozměry svého sektoru - asi tak, jako je důležitý slon rozměry svého těla. Jisté druhy důležitosti jsou **totiž** zcela beznadějně odsouzeny k tomu, že neimponují.

It is a fund accumulated by the members of the community through the practice of speech, a grammatical system existing potentially in every brain, or more exactly in the brains of a group of individuals; **for** the language is never complete in any single individual, but exists perfectly only in the collectivity.

Je to zásobnice, kterou praxí své mluvy členové téhož společenství naplňují, je to gramatický systém, který existuje v mozku každého, či přesněji v mozcích souhrnu jednotlivců. Jazyk **totiž** v žádném z nich není úplný a dokonalý existuje jen v mase.

totiž construction

constructional meaning:

profile perceived cause in the discourse space

activate modal prosody of emphasis

constructional form: post-verb (unstressed) position

because construction

meaning:

profile logical cause in the discourse space

activate logical prosody of causation

form: clause-initial (stressed) position

Contrastive outline of (causal) connectives in Czech and English

Těšitelová et al. (1987) reports an average frequency of conjunctions in Czech of about 10%, whereas a similar analysis carried out on English by Johansson and Hofland (1989) shows conjunctions (both coordinating and subordinating) at just over 5%.

In parallel corpus: Causal connectives in English 53% of the frequency in Czech. Slightly more frequent in Czech-English (similar but less pronounced trend in disjunctive and conjunctive connectives; e.g. *but* .43% 24 vs. *ale* 3.17% 19).

Czech learners of English over-specify causal connectives in target language speech (similar to German students).

English learners of Czech under-specify causal connections in target language speech.

Conclusion: Czech requires more profiling of causal relationships to maintain cohesive harmony (interaction between cohesive chains).

Czech causal cohesive harmony construction

constructional meaning: profile all possible causal coherence links through connectives *plus* direction and/or semantic prosody of emphasis or attitude

constructional form: totiž, tak, proto, protože *plus* Czech elegant variation

English causal cohesive harmony construction

meaning: profile necessary (logical) causal coherence links through connectives *plus* direction and/or semantic prosody of logical inference

form: zero, for, because, so, therefore, thus, which is why, then *plus* English elegant variation

Conclusions / Further questions

- Is text a larger sentence (clause) or is sentence (clause) a smaller text (cf. Hoey, 1991)? I.e. text/discourse/utterance as the basic unit
- Can we think of larger (suprasegmental) structures as constructions (cohesive harmony constructions) or, in other words, can there be said to be a local grammar of cohesive harmony? …
- Can we speak of semantic prosody of constructional meaning?
- How do we integrate affective aspects of domain projection and constructional meaning?
- What is the role of conventionalization of phenomena such as causal relationship or elegant variation in light of explicit cohesive constructional meaning?
- What notation can we use to capture cohesive constructions (do we need to modify CG framework)?
- How can we model these constructions in NLP and AI (so far not much done precisely because of this difficulty – e.g. Hoey – purely surface, Sinclair et al. local grammars)?
- How do we use corpus data to collect evidence since simple collocation searches do not seem enough (small hand-annotated corpora have their limitations)?